

National Highways & Infrastructure Development Corporation

(Technical division)

Minutes of Meeting of Empowered Technical Evaluation Committee (ETEC) for Evaluation of technical bid for “Consultancy Services for Carrying out Feasibility Study, Preparation of Detailed Project Report and providing pre-construction services in respect of 2 laning of (i) Maram-Peren-Dimapur section on NH 129A (Manipur & Nagaland), (ii) Pallel- Chandel Section of NH-102C and (iii) Sangshak-Nampisha on NH 102 A (A Bharatmala Project) on Engineering, Procurement and Construction mode in the state of Manipur(2nd Call)” at NHIDCL on 01.08.2017, New Delhi-**Technical Bid Evaluation- reg.**

- 1) The RFPs for the subject work were invited on 30.05.2017 with bid due date as 13.07.2017 till 1700 hrs.
- 2) In all 05 proposals (based on data uploaded on Infracon portal) were received from the consultancy firms as mentioned below. The envelopes containing bid document cost, bid security, power of Attorney etc were opened accordingly thereafter by Empowered Technical Bid opening Committee (ETBC) on 14.07.2017 in the presence of Bidders representative who choose to attend. Further the ETBC recommended evaluating the Technical Bids through INFRACON as per the provisions of RFP for the following participating firms.
 - a) M/s C E Testing Company Pvt. Ltd.
 - b) M/s Global Infra Solution JV Krishna Techno Consultant Pvt. Ltd.
 - c) M/s S M Consultants.
 - d) M/s Highway Engineering Consultant
 - e) M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.
- 3) Having confirmed the acceptability of the submitted documents in reference to clause 5.1 of RFP document, the first stage evaluation for ascertaining the Proof of Eligibility was carried out through Infracon (as placed at Annexure-A) and the detail is as under.

Sl. No.	Name of Bidder	Eligibility Status of the Participated Firm
1	M/s C E Testing Company Pvt. Ltd	Eligible
2	M/s Global Infra Solution JV Krishna Techno Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	Eligible
3	M/s S M Consultants.	Not Eligible
4	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant	Eligible
5	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.	Eligible

The bottom of the page features several handwritten signatures and initials in blue ink. From left to right, there is a signature that appears to be 'Lish', a signature that looks like 'D' with a horizontal line underneath, a signature that looks like 'Ajay', a signature that looks like 'Dell' with a circled '3' next to it, and a signature that looks like 'Ghosh' with a horizontal line underneath. To the right of these signatures, there is a handwritten '(1/1)' in blue ink.

- 4) M/s S M Consultants Firm failed to satisfy the criteria that the bidder should have prepared DPR for at least one project of 2/4/6 laning of minimum 40% of 100% of the indicative length of the package i.e. 124.8 Km or Feasibility Study for 2/4/6 laning of minimum 60% of 100% of the indicative length of the package i.e. 187.2 Km and the bidder has experience of 101.12 km in Feasibility Study. Hence 4 (Four) of 5 (Five) viz. **M/s C E Testing Company Pvt. Ltd, M/s Global Infra Solution JV Krishna Techno Consultant Pvt. Ltd., M/s Highway Engineering Consultant and M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.** are found eligible for second stage evaluation.
- 5) Accordingly the second stage evaluation was carried out through the Infracon evaluation module for 4 (Four) aforesaid eligible bidders and the results (as placed at Annexure-B) are as under:

Sr. No.	Name of Bidder	Firm's Relevant Experience In The Last 7 Years (Max. points 25)	Equipment and software (Max. points 20)	Qualifications and Competence of the Key Staff for the assignment (Max. points 50)	Adequacy Marks for Work Plan and Methodology (Max. points 5)	Technical Score
1	M/s C E Testing Company Pvt. Ltd	25	20	44.77	5	94.77
2	M/s Global Infra Solution JV Krishna Techno Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	24	16	40.97	5	85.97
3	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant	25	20	42.97	4	91.97
4	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.	25	8	42.96	5	80.96

- 6) The committee deliberated the evaluation through infracon in detail and observed following:

- a) It can be seen from Para 5 above that the technical score of proposal of all the aforesaid 4 (Four) eligible bidder is more than 75 marks out of 100 marks. Hence

Handwritten signatures and initials in blue ink:

the technical proposal of all the aforesaid 4 (Four) eligible bidders is complying the Clause 5.2 of Letter of Invitation (LOI) of RFP.

b) **M/s Global Infra Solution JV Krishna Techno Consultant Pvt. Ltd.**

i) The technical score of Team leader cum Senior Highway Engineer is less than minimum qualifying marks, however as per Clause 3.2.4 (ii) and 5.2 of Letter of Invitation (LOI) of RFP "The CV of the proposed Team Leader should score at least 75 % marks otherwise the entire proposal shall be considered to have failed in the evaluation of Technical Proposals and shall not be considered for opening of Financial Proposals." Hence the committee is of the view that the technical proposal of M/s Global Infra Solution JV Krishna Techno Consultant Pvt. Ltd. may not be considered for financial opening as Team leader cum Senior Highway Engineer is not satisfying the Clause 3.2.4 (ii) and 5.2 of Letter of Invitation (LOI) of RFP.

ii) The technical score of Senior bridge engineer is also less than minimum qualifying marks i.e. 75 marks, however we may ask the bidder during negotiation to give a replacement for the key professional who has scored less than 75% marks by a person of at least 75% score as per Clause 6.6 of Letter of Invitation (LOI) of RFP.

c) As regards to **M/s C E Testing Company Pvt. Ltd, M/s Highway Engineering Consultant and M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.** the technical score of all the key personnel is more than minimum qualifying marks i.e. 75 marks.

7) On Infracon vide circular dated 05.07.2017 it has been informed that the Debarment Order dated 18.05.2017 in favor of M/s Highway Engineering Consultant Bhopal issued by Govt. Of Telangana, has been stayed till 19.07.2017 by Hon'ble High Court of Hyderabad. However it is bought out that stay of the Debarment of M/s Highway Engineering Consultant has been further continued till 28.07.2017 by Hon'ble High Court.

8) Keeping in view Para 4 & 6 above, 3 (Three) out of 5 (Five) bidders are found technically qualified and eligible for financial opening accordingly. The detail is as under:

Sr. No.	Name of Bidder	Technical Score	Technical Responsive/Non responsive
1	M/s C E Testing Company Pvt. Ltd	94.77	Responsive
2	M/s Global Infra Solution JV Krishna Techno Consultant Pvt. Ltd.	85.97	Non-Responsive
3	M/s S M Consultants.	-	Non- Responsive
4	M/s Highway Engineering Consultant	91.97	Responsive (Subject to order of Hon'ble High Court)

Sr. No.	Name of Bidder	Technical Score	Technical Responsive/Non responsive
5	M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.	80.96	Responsive

9) In view of above, the committee recommends for opening of financial bids of following bidders by giving 7 days time and to communicate the technically responsive bidders their Technical score for Clarification/Representation if any by uploading on e-portal with the approval of Competent Authority.

- a) M/s C E Testing Company Pvt. Ltd.
- b) M/s Highway Engineering Consultant.
- c) M/s Technocrats Advisory Services Pvt. Ltd.

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to the chair.



Sanjeev Malik
(ED-III)
Chairman



Col Rajeev Sood
(GM-Tech)
Member
Secretary



Adil Singh
(GM-Tech)
Member



A.K. Jha
DGM (Tech)
Member



U Chatterjee
GM (Finance):
Member